



Universitas Hasanuddin

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

Submission received for Cogent Social Sciences (Submission ID: 230914638)

1 message

OASS-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk <OASS-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>
To: gustiana@unhas.ac.id

Tue, Apr 4, 2023 at 2:55 PM

**Taylor & Francis**
Taylor & Francis Group

Dear Gustiana Kambo,

Thank you for your submission.

Submission ID	230914638
Manuscript Title	Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area
Journal	Cogent Social Sciences
Article Publishing Charge (APC)	USD \$1270.00 (plus VAT or other local taxes where applicable in your country)

**APC only payable if your article is accepted*

You can check the progress of your submission, and make any requested revisions, on the Author Portal.

Thank you for submitting your work to our journal.
If you have any queries, please get in touch with OASS-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk.

For any queries relating to your APC, please get in touch with APC@tandf.co.uk

Kind Regards,
Cogent Social Sciences Editorial Office

Taylor & Francis is a trading name of Informa UK Limited, registered in England under no. 1072954.
Registered office: [5 Howick Place, London, SW1P 1W](#).



Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

230914638 (Cogent Social Sciences) A revise decision has been made on your submission

2 messages

Cogent Social Sciences <em@editorialmanager.com>

Thu, Jun 29, 2023 at 11:08 PM

Reply-To: Cogent Social Sciences <oass-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>

To: Gustiana Kambo <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

Ref: COGENTSOCSOCI-2023-0593

230914638

Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area
Cogent Social Sciences

Dear Kambo,

Your manuscript entitled "Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area", which you submitted to Cogent Social Sciences, has now been reviewed.

The reviews, included at the bottom of the letter, indicate that your manuscript could be suitable for publication following revision. We hope that you will consider these suggestions, and revise your manuscript.

Please submit your revision by Jul 29, 2023, if you need additional time then please contact the Editorial Office.

To submit your revised manuscript please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and log in. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you are unsure how to submit your revision, please contact us on OASS-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

You also have the option of including the following with your revised submission:

* public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public

* about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues.

* photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services (www.tandfedittingservices.com).

Please ensure that you clearly highlight changes made to your manuscript, as well as submitting a thorough response to reviewers.

We look forward to receiving your revised article.

Best wishes,

Gabriela Borz
Senior Editor
Cogent Social Sciences

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Do you want to get recognition for this review on <https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis> target="_blank">Publons?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [<https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis> target="_blank">Learn more]</i></p>

Reviewer 1: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Outstanding

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Outstanding

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Outstanding

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Outstanding

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 1: Sound

Comments to the author

Reviewer 1: The article is exceptionally well-written, and as the author, you have done an outstanding job of exploring the complex relationship between citizenship and identity. The topic itself is intriguing, and the findings presented in the article are both fascinating and substantial. The positive output of the study is reflected in the insightful conclusions drawn from the research. Given the high quality of the work, I wholeheartedly recommend the article for publication with only minor corrections.

However, to further enhance the methodology section, it is crucial to provide specific details regarding why the study was not conducted in Malaysia. Including this clarification will address any potential questions or concerns raised by readers regarding the exclusion of Malaysia from the study.

In order to elaborate on this point, it is important to consider various factors that could have influenced the decision. These factors may include practical considerations such as resource limitations, time constraints, and data availability. Research projects often face budgetary and time restrictions, which can impact the selection of countries included in a study. Additionally, obtaining accurate and comprehensive data on citizenship and identity can be a complex process, especially when dealing with multiple countries. Variations in data accessibility and data collection procedures among different nations may have presented challenges in acquiring suitable data from Malaysia. Moreover, language barriers and cultural nuances can also affect the feasibility of conducting research in a specific country. If the research team lacked the necessary linguistic expertise or understanding of local customs, it might have posed difficulties in effectively collecting and interpreting data in Malaysia.

Do you want to get recognition for this review on [Publons](https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis)?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [[Learn more](https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis)</i></p>

Reviewer 2: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Conclusions – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

References – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions


Writing – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Unsound or fundamentally flawed

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation
Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Comments to the author
Reviewer 2: This is a very interesting piece of work. It can reach the quality required for publication if certain clarifications and additions are carried out.

1. Case Studies: Sociological literature on case studies need to be referred to and engaged with.
2. Research methods: Research ethics procedure should be explained
3. Sampling: How was the sample chosen? In various instances, it seems that this falls under elite interviewing. Please clarify and elaborate.
4. Interpretation of data: How was this carried out? For example, was thematic analysis used? If yes, please elaborate and clarify.
5. Use of language: Needs to improve, both in text, and also in some quotes, parts of which cannot be understood.
6. Some general information (e.g. secondary macro data, maps which explain certain processes) of the Sebatic islands would be of benefit to the reader
7. The theoretical engagement with Weber vis-a-vis rationalisation is very interesting, and the paper needs more of such theoretical engagement.
8. It is unclear why nationalism is seen as under threat.
9. Any political implications? e.g. social movement activism, civil society, electoral demands?


In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/cogentsocsci/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

 **COGENTSOCSCI-2023-0593_reviewer.pdf**
1050K

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: gustianakambo@yahoo.com

Thu, Nov 30, 2023 at 10:32 AM

[Quoted text hidden]

 **COGENTSOCSCI-2023-0593_reviewer.pdf**
1050K



Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

230914638 (Cogent Social Sciences) A revise decision has been made on your submission

2 messages

Cogent Social Sciences <em@editorialmanager.com>

Mon, Oct 9, 2023 at 5:55 AM

Reply-To: Cogent Social Sciences <oass-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>

To: Gustiana Kambo <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

Ref: COGENTSOCSOCI-2023-0593R1

230914638

Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area
Cogent Social Sciences

Dear Kambo,

Your manuscript entitled "Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area", which you submitted to Cogent Social Sciences, has now been reviewed.

The reviews, included at the bottom of the letter, indicate that your manuscript could be suitable for publication following revision. We hope that you will consider these suggestions, and revise your manuscript.

Please submit your revision by Nov 07, 2023, if you need additional time then please contact the Editorial Office.

To submit your revised manuscript please go to <https://rp.cogentoa.com/dashboard/> and log in. You will see an option to Revise alongside your submission record.

If you are unsure how to submit your revision, please contact us on OASS-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk

You also have the option of including the following with your revised submission:

* public interest statement - a description of your paper of NO MORE THAN 150 words suitable for a non-specialist reader, highlighting/explaining anything which will be of interest to the general public

* about the author - a short summary of NO MORE THAN 150 WORDS, detailing either your own or your group's key research activities, including a note on how the research reported in this paper relates to wider projects or issues.

* photo of the author(s), including details of who is in the photograph - please note that we can only publish one photo

If you require advice on language editing for your manuscript or assistance with arranging translation, please do consider using the Taylor & Francis Editing Services (www.tandfedittingservices.com).

Please ensure that you clearly highlight changes made to your manuscript, as well as submitting a thorough response to reviewers.

We look forward to receiving your revised article.

Best wishes,

Robert Read
Senior Editor
Cogent Social Sciences

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Authors are expected to respond in detail to the comments of reviewers and indicate clearly any changes to the text (e.g., in red). There is no indication regarding either of these requirements.

If you wish for your paper to be considered further, please respond accordingly.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at

any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/cogentsocsci/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: Cogent Social Sciences <oass-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>

Mon, Oct 9, 2023 at 11:37 AM

Dear Robert Read,

Thank you for your email and we will revise our manuscript accordingly.

Best regards,

Gustiana Kambo

[Quoted text hidden]



230914638 (Cogent Social Sciences) Your submission has been accepted

3 messages

Cogent Social Sciences <em@editorialmanager.com>

Wed, Nov 22, 2023 at 6:24 AM

Reply-To: Cogent Social Sciences <oass-peerreview@journals.tandf.co.uk>

To: Gustiana Kambo <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

Ref: COGENTSOCSCI-2023-0593R2

230914638

Practices and Challenges of Dual Citizenship at an Indonesian Border Area
Cogent Social Sciences

Dear Gustiana Kambo,

I am pleased to tell you that your work was accepted for publication in Cogent Social Sciences on Nov 21, 2023.

Please note: only minor, or typographical changes can be introduced during typesetting and proofing of your manuscript. Major changes to your manuscript will not be permitted.

For your information, comments from the Editor and Reviewers can be found below if available, and you will have an opportunity to make minor changes at proof stage.

Your article will be published under the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC-BY 4.0), ensuring that your work will be freely accessible by all. Your article will also be shareable and adaptable by anyone as long as the user gives appropriate credit, provides a link to the license, and indicates if changes were made.

Once the version of record (VoR) of your article has been published in Cogent Social Sciences, please feel free to deposit a copy in your institutional repository.

Thank you for submitting your work to this journal, and we hope that you will consider us for your future submissions.

Best wishes

Robert Read
Senior Editor
Cogent Social Sciences

Comments from the Editors and Reviewers:

Do you want to get recognition for this review on [Publons](https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis)?</p><p><i> Don't let your reviewing work go unnoticed! Researchers the world over use Publons to effortlessly track their valuable peer review contributions for any journal. If you opt in, your Publons profile will automatically be updated to show a verified record of this review in full compliance with the journal's review policy. If you don't have a Publons profile, you will be prompted to create a free account. [[Learn more](https://publons.com/publisher/24/taylor-francis)]</i></p>

Reviewer 2: Yes

Title, Abstract and Introduction – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Methodology / Materials and Methods – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Objective / Hypothesis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Figures and Tables – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Results / Data Analysis – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Interpretation / Discussion – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Conclusions – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

References – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Compliance with Ethical Standards – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound with minor or moderate revisions

Writing – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Sound

Supplemental Information and Data – overall evaluation

Reviewer 2: Not applicable

Comments to the author

Reviewer 2: Paper is fit for publication, but requires 3 minor additions/corrections:

1. P.14 this sentence is written twice - If it turns out that they must select one citizen, each person will continue to make efforts to develop relationships with relatives in both Indonesia and Malaysia.
2. Thematic Analysis - please cite sources e.g. Braun and Clarke?
3. Research Ethics - Please state who gave approval to your research ethics procedure (e.g. your University?)
4. Sample - Please give some more information about the sample, e.g. how many people you interviewed

Both reviewers are now supportive of the paper and I am happy to recommend its acceptance. Congratulations!

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/cogentsocsci/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: "A.A.Yani" <aayani@unhas.ac.id>

Wed, Nov 22, 2023 at 3:48 PM

[Quoted text hidden]

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: gustianakambo@yahoo.com

Thu, Nov 30, 2023 at 10:34 AM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Cogent Social Sciences** <em@editorialmanager.com>

Date: Wed, Nov 22, 2023 at 6:24 AM

Subject: 230914638 (Cogent Social Sciences) Your submission has been accepted

To: Gustiana Kambo <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]



Universitas Hasanuddin

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>

Re: Manuscript ID: OASS A 2287610 #TrackingId:17116480

6 messages

OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk <OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk>
To: gustiana@unhas.ac.id

Mon, Nov 27, 2023 at 5:48 PM

Dear Gustiana Kambo,

Thank you for checking this with me.

I will send you the final file for your review before proceeding to publication.

Best Regards,

Sri Meadhaa (She/her)

Production Editor

Cogent Social Sciences

From: gustiana@unhas.ac.id

Sent: 24-11-2023 07:37

To: srimeadhaa.omanakuttan@integra.co.in

Cc:

Subject: Re: Manuscript ID: OASS A 2287610

Dear Editor,

I hope this email finds you well.

I would like to inform you that I have already submitted a revision based on the iAuthor system.

However, since this is my first time using iAuthor, I don't know how to revise manuscripts, especially adding new references.

Accordingly, please find my latest version of our manuscript as attached based on proofread in iAuthor

I do hope that my article will be published soon since I already transferred publication fee to the your bank account

Best regards,

Gustiana Kambo

OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk <OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk>
To: gustiana@unhas.ac.id

Fri, Dec 1, 2023 at 8:08 PM

Dear Gustiana Kambo,

I hope this email finds you well.

Could you please take a moment to review the attached final file and provide your approval before 2nd December to proceed further?

I am looking forward to hearing from you.

Best Regards,

Sri Meadhaa (She/her)

Production Editor

Cogent Social Sciences

[Quoted text hidden]



OASS_A_2287610_O.pdf
1699K

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk

Fri, Dec 1, 2023 at 9:07 PM

Dear Sri Meadhaa,

Thank you for sending the latest draft of our article. I have checked it and I found there is a redundant sentence on page 10. I already highlighted the sentence in the attached file. The rest is confirmed okay as expected.

Best regards,

Gustiana Kambo

[Quoted text hidden]



OASS_A_2287610_O.pdf
1810K

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk

Fri, Dec 1, 2023 at 9:19 PM

Dear Sri,

One more thing.

There is a typo in my profile. It is written "She research focuses on political identity,gender study and politics". It should be "Her research..."

Thank you in advance for your kind support.

Best,

Gustiana Kambo

On Fri, Dec 1, 2023 at 8:08 PM <OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk> wrote:

[Quoted text hidden]

OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk <OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk>
To: gustiana@unhas.ac.id

Sat, Dec 2, 2023 at 11:57 AM

Dear Gustiana Kambo,

Thank you for informing me.

I will make the required changes and proceed further with the publication process.

Thank you for your understanding and cooperation.

[Quoted text hidden]

[Quoted text hidden]

Dr. Gustiana, S.I.P.,M.Si. <gustiana@unhas.ac.id>
To: OASS-production@journals.tandf.co.uk

Sat, Dec 2, 2023 at 4:17 PM

Dear Sri Meadhaa,

Thank you for your kind support and looking forward to seeing our article published.

Best regards,

Gustiana Kambo

[Quoted text hidden]